

## A Study of Life and Death in Noh Play *Kiyotsune* 能『清経』に見る生と死の研究

HATAE Mika

畑江 美佳

---

*Abstract:* 世阿弥元清(1363-1443?)は、能『清経』の中に若き平家公達の死を描いた。源氏との戦いに勇敢に挑み自害した平家武士が多い中、戦わずして自ら生きることを放棄し、九州豊前の国柳ヶ浦に身を投げた清経の死は異色である。彼を死に駆り立てたものは何だったのだろうか。原典『平家物語』から、彼の生い立ち、平家滅亡と武士道、仏教への傾倒、の三点を考察し、清経の死生観を明らかにしたい。

---

*Keywords:* Noh Play *Kiyotsune*, Zeami, *Heike Monogatari*

---

### Kiyotsune's Personality

As far as the Noh play *Kiyotsune* is concerned, there is no mention of his background. However, he is popularly known in the Muromachi period by the original source of the play, *Heike Monogatari*, a military chronicle recited by *biwa hoshi*. Zeami writes in *Sando* how *Heike Monogatari* should be cited in Noh plays:

Should the source of the character central to the play be a famous Heike or Genji warrior, the play should be always composed in accord with the accounts given in *The Tale of the Heike*.<sup>1</sup>

In order to consider his character it is as well to begin with Kiyotsune's episode included in *Heike Monogatari*, Chapter 8, "Dazaifu-ochi":

Shigemori's third son, Middle Captain Kiyotsune, had always had a tendency to brood. "Genji attackers drove us out of the capital, and Koreyoshi expelled us from Chinzei," he said to himself. "We are like fish in a net: there is no escape no matter where we go. What chance do

I have of living out my life?" He composed his mind in the moonlight, went to the side of the boat's cabin, played a melody on his flute, and chanted a *roei*. Then he intoned a sutra in a low voice, murmured some Buddha-invocations, and sank beneath the sea. Men and women alike wept and lamented, but to no avail.<sup>2</sup>

It describes Kiyotsune as a man who has "a tendency to brood" or in other words, "a man of sensitive and meditative nature"<sup>3</sup> or, he is "a man who took things to heart".<sup>4</sup> This "tendency to brood" must have been acquired from his experiences, but also at least partially inherited as well. Consequently, it is worth pausing at this point to consider Kiyotsune's family background.

Kiyotsune was born in 1163 as the third son of Lord Komatsu, Kiyomori's eldest son Shigemori. Shigemori was known as a righteous, merciful and refined man and he tried to restrain his father's policy of violence.<sup>5</sup> He had struggled with concern for his father's rebellious conduct.

How grievous that I must instantly forget my father's kindnesses, which tower higher than the eighty-thousand-league summit of Mount Sumeru, in order to render loyal service to my lord! How painful that I must become a disloyal traitor to my lord in order to avoid the sin of unfilial conduct! No course is open to me; no choice between right and wrong is possible. In the end, it seems best simply to ask you to take my head.<sup>6</sup>

He died of disease in 1179; however, he had prayed for his own death at Kumano Shrine, taking a pessimistic view of the Heike. It is believed that his prayers had brought about his death. Very little is known about Kiyotsune's mother. However, she was a daughter of Fujiwara-no-Ienari, a member of the strongest nobles in the Heian period.<sup>7</sup> As a son of Shigemori, Kiyotsune must have inherited a meditative and pessimistic personality from him. Also, his nobleness and artistic aspects may be explicable by his mother's noble parentage.

Moreover, looking at Kiyotsune's brothers may serve as confirming evidence for understanding his personality. It is said that Shigemori, blessed with an exquisite taste for the elegant and the poetic, planted a grove of cherry trees and built his

mansion there, so that it was freshly arrayed in blossoms with each spring.<sup>8</sup> “Loath to see the flowers scatter after a mere seven days, he offered a petition to the Sun Goddess, and virtuous sovereign on the throne had inspired the goddess to display her powers.”<sup>9</sup> As may be imagined from the episode above, the beautiful cherry blossoms could be seen by his sons. Needless to say, such an aesthetic environment would have a great effect on children.

Kiyotsune’s eldest brother Koremori was a beautiful young man often compared with Hikaru Genji.<sup>10</sup> He fled without fighting in October 1180 at Fuji River, frightened by the sudden sound of numerous ducks flying up at night. He said in tears:

“Like the Himalayan bird, I am constantly thinking, ‘Today! Tomorrow!’ ”  
Blackened by salt winds and emaciated by incessant worry, he little resembled his former self, but even now he was handsomer than other men.<sup>11</sup>

Then he became a monk and finally drowned himself after leaving Yashima to visit the Kumano Shrine in 1184.<sup>12</sup> His next brother Sukemori was renowned as a lover of Kenreimonin-no-Ukyonodaibu,<sup>13</sup> and a good harp player and singer. He was also good at making poems and some of them are in *Shin-Chokusen-Wakashu, New Imperial Collection*, and *Fuga-Wakashu, Collection of Elegance*.<sup>14</sup> He died in 1185 in a fierce battle at Dannoura.<sup>15</sup>

Considering the fact that the Komatsu family tended to have such pessimistic and artistic aspects in their nature, it should come as no surprise to find that Kiyotsune’s personal traits have been molded by his family. Masako Shirasu states that:

Among his clan, he must have been a weak, unprepossessing person rather than a warrior. Although Shigemori had many sons, Koremori being the most well-known, none of them rendered distinguished services. It could be said that this weakness is a trait of the Komatsu family.<sup>16</sup>

Before his death, Kiyotsune “composed his mind in the moonlight, went to the side of the boat’s cabin, played a melody on his flute, and chanted a *roei*.” This

performance symbolizes his noble, sensitive personality, and it even gives us a glimpse of his narcissistic character. In conclusion, it is by now clear that his family background had a great effect on his personality and led him to the pessimistic ideas of life.

### The Fate of the Heike and Bushido

Related in the same way as Kiyotsune's family background is the environment in which he passed his youth. Since the Heike reached the height of its prosperity when Kiyotsune was born, it can be inferred that Kiyotsune was brought up and lived an aristocratic life rather than the steady life of regular warriors. The Heike clan had an absolutely gorgeous life in Kyoto as the strongest nobles since his grandfather Kiyomori was promoted to a higher court rank in 1160 during the *Hogen* era.<sup>17</sup> *Heike Monogatari* depicts their golden age as follows:

Since the Japanese islands contain only sixty-six provinces, the Heike controlled half of them with their more than thirty governorships. They also possessed innumerable private estates and agricultural fields. Their halls, thronged with carriages and horses, were veritable marketplaces. . . . it seemed there was no greater splendor to be found even in the palaces of the reigning sovereign and the Retired Emperor.<sup>18</sup>

The Heike had lived an aristocratic life, regardless of whether they were warriors at first, whose values were anecdotes of fortitude and bravery. The coup d'état that suspended Goshirakawa's *insei*<sup>19</sup> was effected in 1179, when Kiyotsune was 16 years old. Then in 1180, Minamoto no Yoritomo raised his forces in the eastern districts against the Heike. Kiyomori died from disease in February, 1181. Then the Heike fled to Fukuhara with the boy Emperor and his mother. From Fukuhara the Heike sailed to Dazaifu in Kyushu. Finally, Kyoto was occupied by the Genji in July, 1183. Kiyotsune threw himself overboard and was drowned on October 20<sup>th</sup>, 1183.<sup>20</sup> He was only 20 years old. Accordingly, it could be said that the Genji's subsequent attacks changed Kiyotsune's life suddenly and piteously.

In the Noh play *Kiyotsune*, Zeami describes Kiyotsune's situation and emotion when he is driven into a corner by the Genji as follows:

Life is an ever-changing dream,  
 And those who once in the Hogen era  
 Rioted like flowers in spring,  
 Now, in the Juei autumn,  
 Alas, are scattered  
 Like sere and yellow leaves  
 Over the waves,  
 Each leaf, a boat.  
 Snowy-crested billows  
 Urged by the autumn wind from Yanagi  
 Are like a pursuing host.  
 A glimpse of herons caught  
 Amidst the distant pines  
 Makes their spirit quail,  
 Thinking they might be  
 The snow-white pennants of the Genji host. <sup>21</sup>

The Hogen spring when the Heike had been taking over the political ascendancy, contrasts apparently with the Juei autumn. How helpless to float on a boat which shows their insecure position! He must have felt a view of life as something changeable. Moreover, his pessimistic personality must have furthered his despair.

Among many young Heike clansmen who fought bravely for their clan are Atsumori and Tomoakira. Atsumori is one of the famous Heike clansmen known as a brave young warrior who had a single combat against Kumagai Jiro Naozane at Ichinotani in 1183. He was only 17 years old when he was killed.<sup>22</sup> Another warrior is Tomoakira. He died for his father Tomomori at Ichinotani as well. In *Heike Monogatari* it was described as below:

“Tomoakira did a noble deed when he gave his life for his father,”  
 Munemori said. “He was a fine commander-in-Chief, able and

courageous. He and Kiyomune were just the same age sixteen this year.” He glanced with tear-filled eyes at his son, Gate Guards Commander Kiyomune, and all the rows of Heike samurai wept until their sleeves were drenched, the sensitive and the insensitive alike.<sup>23</sup>

These two young warriors illustrate what it was like to live and die as honorable warriors. What was an honorable warrior like in those days? Inazo Nitobe describes in his book, *Bushido*:

Bu-shi-do means literally Military-Knight-Ways the ways which fighting nobles should observe in their daily life as well as in their vocation; in a word, the “Precepts of Knighthood,” the noblesse oblige of the warrior class.<sup>24</sup>

And “Bushido held that the interest of the family and of the members thereof is intact, one and inseparable”.<sup>25</sup> It seems reasonable to suppose that these two young deaths are in accordance with Bushido; a well-known warrior in Edo period named Shihei Hayashi says:

Rectitude is the power of deciding upon a certain course of conduct in accordance with reason, without wavering; to die when it is right to die, to strike when to strike is right.<sup>26</sup>

On the other hand, how do we judge Kiyotsune’s death? In the Noh play *Kiyotsune*, his servant, Awazu-no-Saburo, a fictitious character, tells Kiyotsune’s wife in Kyoto about his death:

Yes, my lady, he has come safely through the recent battles in Tsukushi. But since his way to Miyako was cut off, my lord thought to put an end to his life rather than lose it at the hands of nameless soldiery no better than wayside weeds and while we were off the coast of Yanagi in Buzen Province, late one moonlit night, he leapt overboard and was drowned.<sup>27</sup>

In the Edo period, this play was disliked because the people resented him, reproaching that “how can a bushi drown himself in front of his enemies?”<sup>28</sup> As far as the servant’s words are concerned, Kiyotsune’s death seems noble since he avoids dying miserably, but it is against Bushido since “death for a cause unworthy of dying for, was called ‘a dog’s death’<sup>29</sup>” and “for a true samurai to hasten death or to court it, was alike cowardice. This, then, was Bushido teaching Scar and face all calamities and adversities with patience and a pure conscience”.<sup>30</sup> If he wanted to be noble as a warrior, he should have fought however difficult the situation was. Consequently, it could be said that Kiyotsune’s death is noble but not observed by Bushido.

### Kiyotsune’s Faith in Buddhism

In the Noh play *Kiyotsune*, he expresses his great despair towards the future after the seven-day worship at Usa Hachiman, which had been greatly honored by the Imperial family, and hearing a divine voice solemnly recite:

“No power hath the God of Usa  
To change man’s hateful fate on earth!  
What serves it then to urge Him further?”<sup>31</sup>

As may be imagined from the passage cited above, their depression when they hear the oracle is too hard to withstand. In *Kiyotsune*, it is depicted in a poem by Fujiwara-no-Shunzei included in *Senzaishu, Collection of a Thousand Years*:

“Now the last hope  
Grows faint as insects’ dying song;  
Forlorn indeed is autumn’s eve!”<sup>32</sup>

In the beginning of the play, just as Awazu-no-Saburo states the season is late autumn, which symbolizes the Heike’s adversity<sup>33</sup>, so too “Insects’ dying song” and “autumn’s eve” metaphorically emphasize the pitiful fate of the Heike.

Kiyotsune himself takes this oracle deep in his mind no less than the other people

with him. However, he might take it more seriously through the agency of his pessimistic personality and aristocratic weakness. According to Tatsusaburo Hayashiya's exposition, he says:

What motivated Kiyotsune the most to commit suicide by throwing himself into the sea was the fact the Gods gave up on the Heike. Therefore, the oracle from Usa Hachiman Shrine was very significant for this Noh play *Kiyotsune*.<sup>34</sup>

He ponders Hachiman's fateful words deeply and is possessed by the single thought that the God will never take the side of the Heike for their extravagance.

I feel 'twould be but foolishness  
To save the dew-drop of my foredoomed life,<sup>35</sup>

At this point, he has come to the peak of his depression. He realizes that he cannot escape any further. Despite the fact that many of the Heike clansmen have fought to the end, he is not able to endure this situation any longer.

In the preceding section, Atsumori and Tomoakira's deaths, which I identified as respectable warriors' deaths, have a bearing on Shintoism. Nitobe expounds Buddhism and Shintoism that gave a great influence on Bushido:

It furnished a sense of calm trust in Fate, a quiet submission to the inevitable, that stoic composure in sight of danger or calamity, that disdain of life and friendliness with death. . . . What Buddhism failed to give, Shintoism offered in abundance. Such loyalty to the sovereign, such reverence for ancestral memory, and such filial piety as are not taught by any other creed, were inculcated by the Shinto doctrines, imparting passivity to the otherwise arrogant character of the samurai.<sup>36</sup>

It is clear that young Atsumori and Tomoakira have devoted themselves to loyalty to the Heike, as observed by Shintoism, while Kiyotsune has dedicated himself to Buddhism<sup>37</sup>, which emphasizes the sorrow of the present world and rejects its



transient pleasures. It stresses karma and encourages one to seek enlightenment by renouncing the world.<sup>38</sup>

In Kiyotsune's time, the Heian period in the 12<sup>th</sup> century, the *Jodo* sect<sup>39</sup> of Buddhism had widely spread all over Japan. Their main philosophy was *mujo*, a view of life as something transient and empty. The beginning of *Heike Monogatari* portrays this view of *mujo* as follows:

The sound of the Gion Shôja bells echoes the impermanence of all things;  
the color of the sâla flowers reveals the truth that the prosperous must  
decline. The proud do not endure, they are like a dream on a spring night;  
the mighty fall at last, they are as dust before the wind. <sup>40</sup>

It is natural to assume that Kiyotsune's idea of life and death partly comes from the idea of *mujo* taught in the *Jodo* sect of Buddhism. For him, "a life is as dust before the wind". Now he knows that "all existences and phenomena in this world are changing constantly and do not remain the same for even a single moment. Everything has to die or end someday in its future, and such a prospect is the very cause of suffering"<sup>41</sup>. And the phrases he chanted below show his last awareness of life and death:

Once fallen in the pit  
The selfsame grievous lot  
Awaits all men.<sup>42</sup>

Meanwhile, Buddha teaches a similar idea about life:

Times of luxury do not last long, but pass away very quickly;  
Nothing in this world can be enjoyed forever<sup>43</sup>

Suffice it to say here that Kiyotsune's ideas of life and death have reached to the teaching of Buddha. Eventually he threw himself into the sea, chanting ten prayers of Amida. This chanting section is not included in *Heike Monogatari*, nor in *Genpei Seisui-ki*,<sup>44</sup> but it is Zeami's creation. Itaru Nakamura describes about this creation as below:

The one reason why Zeami created such a battle scene in the hell as a form of *shura* in the end, which is not in the original text, is probably that it is needed to form a dramatization as a *shura-mono*. On the other hand, it is a figure of Kiyotsune's inner world as a philosophical intellectual warrior and we must not overlook that it also forms a part of a psychological drama.<sup>45</sup>

In the last part of the play, the intensity of feeling of Kiyotsune is gathering momentum. He is fascinated with the power to ensure immediate rebirth into the Western Paradise by repeating the prayers. Reaching the climax of the play, Kiyotsune's vigorous dance and songs embody that he is finally purified from all the sins.

Kiyotsune, the 'Pure'-hearted,  
 Kiyotsune, the 'Pure'-hearted  
 Now enters the Western Paradise.  
 Praised be Amida!<sup>46</sup>

As may be gathered from this section, Kiyotsune's profound faith to Buddhism has guided him to the Western Paradise. He wants to be noble not as a part of the Heike but as a man who deeply embraces Buddhism. He is rather a noble, sensitive and devout young man than a bellicose and rough-natured man like most of the other Heike clansmen.

Zeami depicted the currents the most efficiently in Kiyotsune and it is also notable that *Heike Monogatari* was a chronicle, but the central theme of the play is changed into an intricate psychological and philosophical human drama by this great playwright. On the basis of his character, experiences and his belief in Buddhism, it can be concluded that these aspects lead him to the ideas of life and death: "our life is but a travail and I can quit this world without regret."<sup>47</sup>

## Notes

- 
- <sup>1</sup> Thomas Rimer and Masakazu Yamazaki, “The Three Elements in Composing a Play”, *On the Art of the No Drama: The Major Treatises of Zeami*, Princeton, 1984, p.155  
 「軍体の能姿。仮令、源平の名将の人体の本説ならば、ことにことに平家の物語の、まゝに書べし。」(Akira Omote and Shuichi Kato, Ed., *Zeami Zenchiku*, Iwanami Shoten, 1974, p.138)
- <sup>2</sup> Helen Craig McCullough, Trans., *The Tale of the Heike*, Stanford University Press, 1988, pp.265-266  
 「小松殿の三男左の中将清経は、もとより何事も思ひいれたる人なれば、「都をば源氏がためにせめおとされ、鎮西をば維義がために追ひ出さる。網にかかれる魚のごとし。いづくへゆかばのがるべきかは。ながらへはつべき身にもあらず」とて月の夜心を澄まし、舟の屋形に立ちいでて、横笛ねとり朗詠してあそばれけるが、閑に経よみ念仏して、海にぞ沈み給ひける。男女泣きかなしめども甲斐ぞなき。」(Teiji Ichiko, trans. and ed., *Heike Monogatari*, vol.2, Shogakkan, 1994, pp.119-120)
- <sup>3</sup> Hiroshi Kitagawa and Bruce T. Tsuchida, Trans., *The Tale of the Heike*, University of Tokyo Press, 1975, p.473
- <sup>4</sup> Chifumi Shimazaki, *The Noh volume 2 • Battle Noh in Parallel Translations with an Introduction and Running Commentaries*, Hinoki Shoten, 1987, p.130
- <sup>5</sup> *ibid.*, McCullough, pp.73-75
- <sup>6</sup> *ibid.*, McCullough, p.76  
 「悲しき哉君の御ために、奉公の忠をいたさんとすれば、迷廬八万の頂より猶たかき、父の恩忽ちに忘れんとす。痛ましき哉不孝の罪をのがれんと思へば、君の御ために既に不忠の逆臣となりぬべし。進退惟谷れり。是非いかにも弁へがたし。申しうくるところ詮はただ重盛が頸を召され候へ。」(Ichiko, vol.2, pp.137-138)
- <sup>7</sup> Kaichiro Yabuta, “Sakuhin Kenkyu Kiyotsune”, *Kanze*, July-August 1969, Hinoki Shoten, 1969, p.3
- <sup>8</sup> *ibid.*, McCullough, p.29
- <sup>9</sup> *ibid.*, McCullough, p.29
- <sup>10</sup> Hikaru Genji: “a dashing and amorous young hero in *Genji Monogatari* written by Murasaki Shikibu.” (*Kodansha Encyclopedia of Japan*, vol.5, Kodansha, 1983, p.35)
- <sup>11</sup> *ibid.*, McCullough, p.344  
 「『維盛が身の、いつとなく雪山の鳥の鳴くらんやうに、今日よあすよと思ふ物を』とて、涙く

み給ふぞあはれなる。塩風にくろみ、つきせぬ物思にやせ衰へて、その人とは見え給はねども、なほよの人にはすぐれ給へり。」 (Ichiko, *vol.2*, p.303)

<sup>12</sup> *ibid.*, McCullough, pp.348-350

<sup>13</sup> Jun Kubota, Trans. and Ed., *Kenreimonin-no-Ukyonodaibu Shu, Towazugatari*, Trans., Shogakkan, 1999, Many poems were sent to Kenreimonin-no-Ukyonodaibu.

<sup>14</sup> Kazuma Otori, Ed., *Shin-Chokusen-Wakashu Kochushaku to Sono Kenkyu*, Shimonkaku Shuppan, 1986, pp.67-68, Poem No. 167「さみたれの日をふるままにひまそなきあしのしのやの軒の玉水」

Miyoko Iwasa, Ed., *Fuga-Wakashu Zenchushaku Chukan*, Kasama Shoin, 2003, p.120, Poem No. 1089「中ゝにたのめざりせばさよ衣かへすしるしはみえもしなまし」

<sup>15</sup> Chifumi Shimazaki, *Warrior Ghost Plays from the Japanese Noh Theater*, Cornell University, 1993, pp.189-195

<sup>16</sup> Masako Shirasu, *Yokyoku Heike Monogatari*, Kodansha, 1998, p.133, translated by Mika Hatae.

<sup>17</sup> *ibid.*, Shimazaki, *Warrior...*, pp.189-195

<sup>18</sup> *ibid.*, McCullough, p.30

「日本秋津島は、纔かに六十六箇国、平家知行の国、卅余箇国、既に半国にこえたり。其他莊園田畠、いくらといふ数を知らず。綺羅充滿して、堂上花の如し。軒騎群集して、門前市をなす。…恐らくは帝闕も仙洞も是には過ぎじとぞみえし。」 (Ichiko, *vol.1*, pp.33.34)

<sup>19</sup> *insei*: “The system of government that prevailed between the abdication of Emperor Shirakawa in 1087 and the establishment of warrior government in 1192.” (*Kodansha encyclopedia of Japan, vol. 3*, p.314)

<sup>20</sup> *ibid.*, Shimazaki, *Warrior...*, pp.189-195

<sup>21</sup> *ibid.*, Nippon Gakujutsu Shinkokai, p.70

「げにや世の中乃。移る夢こそ真なれ。保元の春乃花寿永の秋の紅葉とて。散々になり浮かむ。一葉乃舟なれや。柳が浦の秋風乃。追手がほなる後の波 白鷺の群れ居る松見れば。源氏の旗を靡かす多勢かと肝を消す。」 (Kanze Sakon, “Kiyotsune”, *Kanzeryu Yokyoku Hyakuban-shu*, Hinoki Shoten, 2001, pp.1099-1100)

<sup>22</sup> *ibid.*, McCullough, pp.315-317

<sup>23</sup> *ibid.*, McCullough, p.319

「『武蔵守の父の命にかはられけるこそありがたけれ。手もきき心も剛に、よき大將軍にておはしつる人を。清宗と同年にて、今年十六な』とて、御子衛門督のおはしけるかたを御覧じ

て涙ぐみ給へば、いくらもなみみたりける平家の侍ども、心あるも心なきも、皆鎧の袖をぞぬらしける。」(Ichiko, *vol.2*, p.240)

<sup>24</sup> Inazo Nitobe, *Taiyaku Bushido*, Mikasa Shobo, 2003, p.8

<sup>25</sup> *ibid.*, Nitobe, p.40

<sup>26</sup> *ibid.*, Nitobe, p.16

Yutaka Yamamoto, Ed., *Hayashi Shihei Zenshu 1*, Seikatsu Sha, 1943

<sup>27</sup> *ibid.*, Nippon Gakujutsu Shinkokai, p.63

「さん候過ぎにし筑紫の戦にも御恙御座なく候ひしが。清経心に思し召すやうは。都へはとても歸らぬ道芝の。雑兵乃手にかからんよりはと思し召されけるか。豊前の国柳が浦の沖にして。更け行く月乃夜船より身を投げ空しくなりに給ひて候」(Kanze Sakon, p.1092)

<sup>28</sup> Rei Yuzaki, *Noh no Wakaru Hon*, Kinensha, 1990, p.78, translated by Mika Hatae.

<sup>29</sup> *ibid.*, Nitobe, p.20

<sup>30</sup> *ibid.*, Nitobe, p.56

<sup>31</sup> *ibid.*, Nippon Gakujutsu Shinkokai, p.69

「世の中乃。うさには神も。なきものを。なに祈るらん。心づくしに」(Kanze Sakon, p.1099)

<sup>32</sup> *ibid.*, Nippon Gakujutsu Shinkokai, p.6

「さりともと。思ふこゝろも虫の音も。弱り果てぬる。秋の暮れかな」(Kanze Sakon, p.1099)

<sup>33</sup> Hiroshi Koyama, Kikuo Sato and Kenichiro Sato, Trans. and Ed., *Yokyokushu 1*, Shogakkan, 1973, p.199

<sup>34</sup> “Kiyotsune wo Megutte (Zadankai)”, *Kanze*, July-August 1969, Hinoki Shoten, 1969, p.16, translated by Mika Hatae.

<sup>35</sup> *ibid.*, Nippon Gakujutsu Shinkokai, p.71 「あぢきなやとても消ゆべき露の身を」(Kanze Sakon, p.1100)

<sup>36</sup> *ibid.*, Nitobe, p.12

<sup>37</sup> *ibid.*, Kitagawa, p. xxxiii, “The early controversy between Shintoism and Buddhism was not due to a conflict of principles but to political rivalry between supporters of the two beliefs. At the time of the Heike both religions were compatible.”

<sup>38</sup> *ibid.*, Kitagawa, p.xxxiii

<sup>39</sup> *Jodo* sect: “The school of Pure Land Buddhism founded by Honen (1133-1212), known for its advocacy of Nembutsu, the practice of chanting the phrase *Namu Amida Butsu* (I take my refuge in Amida Buddha), for the purpose of *oyo*, rebirth in Amida Buddha’s Pure Land in the West.” (*Kodansha Encyclopedia of Japan*, *vol.4*, p.67)

---

<sup>40</sup> *ibid.*, McCullough, p.23

「祇園精舎の鐘の声。諸行無常の響あり。娑羅双樹の花の色、盛者必衰の理をあらはす。おごれる人も久しからず、唯春の夜の夢のごとし。たけき者も遂にはほろびぬ、偏に風の前の塵に同じ。」 (Ichiko, *vol.1*, p.19)

<sup>41</sup> Bukkyo Dendo Kyokai, *The Teaching of Buddha*, Bukkyo Dendo Kyokai, 1975, p.588

<sup>42</sup> *ibid.*, Nippon Gakujutsu Shinkokai, p.72

「言ふならく。奈落も同じ。泡沫の。あはれは誰も。變らざりけり」 (Kanze Sakon, p.1102)

<sup>43</sup> *ibid.*, Bukkyo Dendo Kyokai, p.196

<sup>44</sup> *Genpei Seisui-ki*: “*The Rise and Fall of the Genji and Heike*. A military chronicle of unknown authorship dating from the Kamakura period” (*Kodansha Encyclopedia of Japan*, *vol. 3*, p.16)

<sup>45</sup> Itaru Nakamura, *Muromachi Nohgaku Ronko*, Wanya Shoten, 1994, p.286, translated by Mika Hatae.

<sup>46</sup> *ibid.*, Nippon Gakujutsu Shinkokai, p.73

「げにも心は清経がげにも心は。清経が佛果を得しこそありがたけれ」 (Kanze Sakon, p.1103)

<sup>47</sup> *ibid.*, Nippon Gakujutsu Shinkokai, p.71